

To: Kathy Glennan, Chair, RDA Steering Committee

CC: Renate Behrens, RSC Chair-Elect  
Linda Barnhart, RSC Secretary  
Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary -Elect

From: Charlotte Christensen, ORDAC back-up representative

Subject: Formal response to RSC/RSCSecretary/2022/2 - Proposal to adjust instructions in four "restriction on" elements in Manifestation and Item

In general ORDAC supports the recommendations.

ORDAC believes that users may well search for the term 'part' which we have now corrected to 'unit'. To avoid confusion, ORDAC suggests that the Glossary definition of "part" be updated with a reference to "unit". Suggested wording:

**Part**

A format of notated music that consists of the music for the use of one or more, but not all, performers.

For a physical or logical part of a manifestation, see **Unit**.

ORDAC acknowledges that this suggestion may be beyond the scope of this proposal and better handled as a fast track.

**Recommendation 1**

ORDAC approves of the direction of this recommendation. We support the simplicity of the Translation Teams Liaison Officer's response in term of rewording. To us this seems clearer than the recommended wording of the conditions and options and makes good use of the terminology the RSC wants to support.

We also take on board the Technical Team Liaison Officer's concerns about the conflation between manifestation-level descriptive elements and elements which in fact reflect data provenance and are more appropriately handled at the work-level for that reason. We consider that this issue requires further investigation and perhaps a separate discussion at a future meeting since this seems to indicate a larger problem of distinguishing data provenance-related values and identifying the most appropriate element for those values to be represent.

**Recommendation 2**

ORDAC approves of this recommendation in terms of the renaming of the element.

We like the Examples Editor's suggestion that this should be moved to being a work-level element rather than a manifestation-level one. This resolves several of the issues raised in our response to recommendation 1.

We agree with several others that the word 'issue' should be removed from the definition.

In terms of the suggestion by others that 'integrating manifestation' should be included in the glossary, ORDAC believes that there is no such thing as an integrating manifestation and that what is described here is the manifestation of an integrating work.

**Recommendation 3**

ORDAC approves of this recommendation.

In agreement with the Translation Teams Liaison Officer's comments, we would approve a change to the definition of the element.

ORDAC also agrees with the Technical Team Liaison Officer's comment that the option wording should be expanded to cover both serial works and manifestations of an integrating work.

**Recommendation 4**

ORDAC approves of this recommendation. We prefer the wording of the Translation Teams Liaison Officer.

**Recommendation 5**

ORDAC approves of this recommendation.

**Recommendation 6**

ORDAC approves of this recommendation.

**Recommendation 7**

ORDAC approves of this recommendation, with the typographical error "person" corrected to "family" in the option.

**Recommendation 8**

ORDAC approves of this recommendation to change "serial" to "serial work".

In agreement with the Translation Teams Liaison Officer's comments, we would approve a change to the definition of the element.

**Recommendation 9**

ORDAC does not approve of this recommendation.